

PONTIFICIA STUDIORUM UNIVERSITAS  
A SANCTO THOMA AQUINATE IN URBE

*ANGELICUM*



*UTRUM SINT ANGELI:*

THE ARGUMENTS OF SAINT THOMAS AQUINAS FOR THE  
EXISTENCE OF THE ANGELS

BY

REV. ANTHONY UY, F.S.S.P.

DIRECTOR: FR. SERGE-THOMAS BONINO, O.P.

A THESIS

SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF THEOLOGY  
OF THE PONTIFICAL UNIVERSITY OF SAINT THOMAS IN ROME  
IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS  
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTORATE IN SACRED THEOLOGY

ROMAE

MMXXIV

## ABSTRACT

Saint Thomas Aquinas throughout his career proposed many arguments for the existence of the angels across various theological and philosophical works. This dissertation aims to present them in a chronological order and evaluate them according to his own thought and sources in order to bring to light developments in his thought regarding this particular area of study. Thus, the investigation will first consider what St. Thomas wrote concerning the separate substances from his understanding of Plato and Aristotle and with what ideas Aquinas would have been familiar with respect to the Aristotelian commentators as well as the thought of his contemporaries especially in the medieval University of Paris. The central focus of this dissertation, as reflected in the order of presentation, is the development of St. Thomas's own arguments from his earlier works which became more elegant as his thought matured with time. This approach shows that the array of his multifaceted arguments forms two distinct categories, as much chronologically as thematically, firstly, into the many early and (mostly) *a priori* arguments from fittingness of order and perfection in the universe, and secondly, into the later and *quia* demonstration from the operations of demons. A historical survey of the reception of his arguments caps this study and brings to light the relevance of Aquinas's thought in the various eras of Thomism and gives a more robust perspective of the *status quaestionis* today.

## ABBREVIATIONS

### Works of Saint Thomas Aquinas

<i>In Phys.</i>	<i>Commentaria in Aristotelis libros Physicorum</i>
<i>De ente</i>	<i>De ente et essentia</i>
<i>De subs. sep.</i>	<i>De substantiis separatis</i>
<i>In Metaph.</i>	<i>In duodecum libros Metaphysicorum Aristotelis expositio</i>
<i>In de Div. Nom.</i>	<i>In librum Beati Dionysii de Divinis Nominibus expositio</i>
<i>Q. de spir. creat.</i>	<i>Quaestio disputata de spiritualibus creaturis</i>
<i>Q. de malo</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de malo</i>
<i>Q. de pot.</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de potentia</i>
<i>Q. de ver.</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de veritate</i>
<i>De 36 art.</i>	<i>Responsio ad Lectorem Venetum de 46 articulis</i>
<i>De 43 art.</i>	<i>Responsio ad Magistrum Ioannes de Vercellis de 43 articulis</i>
<i>In Sent.</i>	<i>Scriptum super libros sententiarum</i>
<i>In De anima</i>	<i>Sentencia libri De anima</i>
<i>SCG</i>	<i>Summa Contra Gentiles</i>
<i>ST</i>	<i>Summa Theologiae</i>
<i>Super Boeth. de Trin.</i>	<i>Super libros Boethii De Trinitate et De hebdomadibus</i>
<i>Super Librum de Causis</i>	<i>Super Librum de Causis expositio</i>

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ABSTRACT</b> .....	<b>III</b>
<b>ABBREVIATIONS</b> .....	<b>IV</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b> .....	<b>V</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>PROLOGUE: PHILOSOPHY AND THEOLOGY ON THE ANGELS</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1: SAINT THOMAS ON PLATO AND ARISTOTLE</b> .....	<b>14</b>
1.1. ST. THOMAS ON PLATO.....	15
1.2. ST. THOMAS ON ARISTOTLE.....	22
1.3. ST. THOMAS ON THE AGREEMENT AND DISAGREEMENT OF PLATO AND ARISTOTLE .....	32
<b>CHAPTER 2: SOURCES OF ST. THOMAS AQUINAS</b> .....	<b>46</b>
2.1. THE ARABIC AND JEWISH SOURCES.....	48
2.1.1. Avicenna.....	48
2.1.2. Avicbron .....	62
2.1.3. Averroes .....	69
2.1.4. Moses Maimonides.....	75
2.2. PREDECESSORS AND CONTEMPORARIES FROM THE UNIVERSITY OF PARIS.....	81
2.2.1. Alexander of Hales.....	81
2.2.2. William of Auvergne.....	87
2.2.3. St. Bonaventure .....	98
2.2.4. St. Albert the Great.....	108
<b>CHAPTER 3: THE ARGUMENTS OF SAINT THOMAS FOR THE EXISTENCE OF THE ANGELS</b> .....	<b>126</b>
3.1. EARLIER ARGUMENTS (1258-1268) .....	128
3.1.1. Summa Contra Gentiles II, 46.....	129
3.1.2. Summa Contra Gentiles II, 91 .....	143
3.1.3. Summa Theologiae I, q. 50, art. 1. ....	172
3.1.4. Summa Theologiae I, q. 51, art. 1. ....	179
3.1.5. Quaestio Disputata de Spiritualibus Creaturis, a. 5.....	186
Analysis 1: The human soul and the genus of incorporeal substances. ....	206
Analysis 2: On the possibility of a philosophical demonstration.....	215
Analysis 3: The value of arguments ex convenientia.....	222
3.2. LATER ARGUMENTS (1269-1272).....	225
3.2.1. Quaestiones Disputatae de Malo, q. 16, a. 1 .....	226
3.2.2. De Substantiis Separatis.....	230

<b>CHAPTER 4: MILESTONES IN THE HISTORICAL RECEPTION OF ST. THOMAS’S</b>	
<b>ARGUMENTS .....</b>	<b>240</b>
4.1. EVOLUTION OF THE QUESTION: THE EXISTENCE OF THE ANGELS IN THE LATE MIDDLE AGES .....	241
4.1.1. Durandus of St. Pourcain.....	242
4.1.2. John Buridan.....	246
4.2. THE THOMISTIC COMMENTATORS .....	251
4.2.1. Thomas de Vio Cajetan .....	252
4.2.2. Francisco Silvestri of Ferrara (Ferrariensis).....	257
4.2.3. John of St. Thomas.....	261
4.2.4. Francisco Suarez.....	264
4.3. TRANSITION FROM CLASSICAL THOMISM TO NEOTHOMISM.....	269
4.3.1. Charles René Billuart .....	274
4.3.2. Salvatore Roselli.....	276
4.3.3. Gaetano Sanseverino .....	279
4.4. THE NEOTHOMIST REVIVAL.....	280
4.4.1. Giovanni Maria Cornoldi and Tommaso Zigliara .....	280
4.4.2. Edouard Hugon.....	283
4.4.3. James Collins.....	286
4.5. STATUS QUAESTIONIS (1950-PRESENT) .....	292
4.5.1. Position one: Philosophical angelology is impossible .....	293
4.5.2. Position two: Aquinas’s a priori arguments are valid .....	296
4.5.3. Position three: Aquinas did propose a demonstrative quia argument .....	301
<b>CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>305</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>	<b>309</b>
Older Works .....	309
Contemporary Works .....	312
<b>INDEX OF PROPER NAMES .....</b>	<b>317</b>

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Older Works

- Albert the Great. *Summa Theologiae sive De mirabilia scientia Dei, lib. 1, pars 1, q. 1-50A*. Edited by Dionysius Siedler et al. Cologne Edition. Vol. 34.1. 1978.
- . *De causis et processu universitatis a Prima Causa*. Edited by Winfridus Fauser. Cologne Edition. Vol. 17.2. 1993.
- . *Problemata determinata*. Edited by James Weisheipl. Cologne Edition. Vol. 17.1. 1975.
- . *Commentarii in II Sententiarum*. Opera Omnia 27. Edited by Auguste Borgnet. Paris: Vivés, 1894.
- . *Summa Theologiae II, q. 1-67*. Opera Omnia 32. Edited by Auguste Borgnet. Paris: Vivés, 1895.
- . *De motibus animalium*. Opera Omnia 9. Edited by Auguste Borgnet. Paris: Vivés, 1890.
- . *De mineralibus*. Opera Omnia 5. Edited by Auguste Borgnet. Paris: Vivés, 1890.
- Alexander of Hales. *Summae Theologicae I pars, bk. 2*. Vol. 2. Quaracchi, 1928.
- Anselm. *Proslogion: with a reply on behalf of the fool by Gaunilo and the author's reply to Gaunilo*. Translated by M. J. Charlesworth. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1979.
- Aristotle. "Metaphysics." In *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, edited by Richard McKeon. New York: Random House, 1941.
- . "Metaphysics." In *Commentary on Aristotle's Metaphysics*, by Thomas Aquinas, translated by John Rowan. Notre Dame, IN: Dumb Ox Books, 1995.
- . "Physics." In *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, edited by Robert McKeon. New York: Random House, 1941.
- Augustine. *De Civitate Dei, libri I-X*. Corpus Christianorum. Series Latina. Vol. 47. Brepols: Turnhout, 2014.
- Averroes. *Ibn Rushd's Metaphysics: A translation with Introduction of of Ibn Rushd's Commentary on Aristotle's Metaphysics, Book Lām*. Translated by Charles Genequand. Leiden: Brill, 1986.
- . *On Aristotle's "Metaphysics: an annotated translation of the so-called "Epitome"*. Edited by Rüdiger Arnzen. New York: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co., 2010.
- Avicbron. *Fons Vitae: Ex Arabico in Latinum translatus*. Translated by Johannes Hispanus and Dominicus Gundissalinus. Münster: Aschendorff, 1892.
- Avicenna. *Avicenna's Psychology: An English translation of Kitāb al-Najāt*. Translated by Fazlur Rahman. London: Oxford University Press, 1981.
- . *Metaphysices Compendium: ex Arabo Latinum*. Translated by Nematallah Caramé. Rome: Pont. Institute for Oriental Studies, 1926.
- . *The Metaphysics of The Healing: A parallel English-Arabic text. [Ilāhiyyāt]*. Translated by Michael Marmura. Provo, UT: Brigham Young University Press, 2005.
- Billuart, Charles-René. *Tractatus de Angelis*. Vol. 2, in *Summa Sancti Thomae*. Paris: Victor Lecoffre, 1904.
- Bonaventure. *Breviloquium*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 5. Quaracchi, 1891.
- . *Breviloquium*. Works of Bonaventure. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 2005.
- . *Commentaria in Quatuor Libros Sententiarum*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 2. Quaracchi, 1885.
- . *In Hexaameron*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 5. Quaracchi, 1891.
- . *Quaestiones disputatae de mysterio Trinitatis*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 5. Quaracchi, 1891.

- Cajetan, Thomas de Vio. *Commentaria in Summam Theologiam*. Vol. 5, in *Summa Theologiae I, q. 50-119*, by Thomas Aquinas. 1889.
- . *Commentary on Being and Essence*. Translated by Kendzierski and Wade. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1964.
- Copernicus, Nicolaus. *De revolutionibus orbium coelestium - Translated*. Vols. 2, no. 10, in *Occasional Notes of the Royal Astronomical Society*, translated by John Dobson and Selig Brodetsky. London: Royal Astronomical Society, 1947.
- . *De Revolutionibus Orbium Coelestium*. Nuremberg: Johannes Petreius, 1543.
- Cornoldi, Giovanni Maria. *La Filosofia Scolastica di San Tommaso e di Dante*. Rome: A. Befani, 1889.
- Ferrariensis, Franciscus de Sylvestris. *Commentaria in SCG*. Vol. 13, in *Summa Contra Gentiles*, by Thomas Aquinas. 1918.
- Gulielmus de Tocco. *Ystoria Sancti Thome de Aquino de Guillaume de Tocco (1323)*. Toronto, ON: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1996.
- Hugh of Saint Victor. *On the Sacraments of the Christian Faith (De Sacramentis)*. Translated by Roy Deferrari. Cambridge, MA: The Mediaeval Academy of America, 1951.
- Joannes Capreolus. *Defensiones Theologiae divi Thomae Aquinatis: In II Sent.* Edited by Ceslaus Paban and Thomas Pègues. Vol. 3. Tours: Alfred Cattier, 1902.
- Johannes Trithemius. "Catalogus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum." In *Commentary on the Sentences*, by Durandus de Sancto Porciano. Lyons, 1613.
- John Buridan. *In Metaphysicam Aristotelis Quaestiones Argutissimae*. Paris, 1518.
- John Chrysostom. *Homilies on the Gospel of Matthew*. PG 57.
- John Damascene. *De Fide Orthodoxa: versions of Burgundio and Cerbanus*. Edited by Eligius Buytaert. St. Bonaventure, NY: The Franciscan Institute, 1955.
- John of St. Thomas. *Cursus Philosophicus Thomisticus*. Vol. 2. Paris: Vivès, 1883.
- . *Cursus Theologicus*. Vol. 4. Paris: Desclée, 1953.
- Moses Maimonides. *The Guide for the Perplexed*. 2nd Edition. Translated by M. Friedländer. Skokie, IL: Varda Books, 2002.
- Peter Lombard. *The Sentences, Book 2: on Creation*. Translated by Giulio Silano. Toronto, ON: PIMS, 2008.
- Philip of the Most Holy Trinity. *Metaphysica*. Summa Philosophica ex Mira Principis Philosophorum Aristotelis et Doctoris Angelici Divi Thomae Doctrina. Vol. 3. Cologne: Wilhelmi Friessem, 1655.
- Roselli, Salvatore. *De substantiis spiritualibus completis, sive de Angelis*. Summa Philosophica. Vol. 2. Bologna: Antonium Borghi, 1858.
- Sanseverino, Gaetano. *Cosmologia*. Elementa Philosophiae Christianae. Vol. 2. Naples: Apud Officinam Bibliothecae Catholicae, 1873.
- Suarez, Francisco. *Disputationes Metaphysicae*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 26. Paris: Vivès, 1861.
- . *Tractatus de Angelis*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 2. Paris: Vivès, 1856.
- Thomas Aquinas. *Commentaria in Aristotelis libros Peri hermeneias et Posteriorum analyticorum*. Leonine edition. Vol. 1. 1882.
- . *Commentaria in Aristotelis libros Physicorum*. Leonine edition. Vol. 2. 1884.
- . *Commentaria in Aristotelis De caelo, De generatione et Meteorologicorum*. Leonine edition. Vol. 3. 1886.

- *Summa Theologiae I, q. 1-49 cum commentariis Caietani*. Leonine edition. Vol. 4. 1888.
  - *Summa Theologiae I, q. 50-119 cum commentariis Caietani*. Leonine edition. Vol. 5. 1889.
  - *Summa Theologiae III, q. 1-59 cum commentariis Caietani*. Leonine edition. Vol. 11. 1903.
  - *Summa Contra Gentiles, lib., 1-2 cum commentariis Ferrariensis*. Leonine edition. Vol. 13. 1918.
  - *Summa Contra Gentiles, lib., 3 cum commentariis Ferrariensis*. Leonine edition. Vol. 14. 1926.
  - *Quaestiones disputatae de veritate, q. 1-7*. Leonine edition. Vol. 22.1.2. 1970.
  - *Quaestiones disputatae de veritate, q. 8-12*. Leonine edition. Vol. 22.2.1. 1970.
  - *Quaestiones disputatae de veritate, q. 21-29*. Leonine edition. Vol. 22.3.1. 1973.
  - *Quaestiones disputatae de malo*. Leonine edition. Vol. 23. 1982.
  - *Quaestio disputata de spiritualibus creaturis*. Leonine edition. Vol. 24.2. 1982.
  - *De substantiis separatis, Super Decretales*. Leonine edition. Vol. 40.D-E. 1968.
  - *Compendium theologiae, De articulis fidei, De 108 art., De 43 art., De 36 art., De 6 art., Ad ducissam Brabantiae, De emptione, Ad Bernardum abbatem, De regno, De secreto*. Leonine edition. Vol. 42. 1979.
  - *De principiis naturae, De aeternitate mundi, De motu cordis, De mixtione elementorum, De operationibus occultis naturae, De iudiciis astrorum, De sortibus, De unitate intellectus, De ente et essentia, De fallaciis, De propositionibus modalibus*. Leonine edition. Vol. 43. 1976.
  - *Sentencia libri De anima*. Leonine edition. Vol. 45. 1984.
  - *Super libros Boethii De Trinitate et De hebdomadibus*. Leonine edition. Vol. 50. 1992.
  - *In duodecim libros Metaphysicorum Aristotelis expositio*. Edited by M. R. Cathala. Rome: Marietti, 1964.
  - *Super Librum de Causis expositio*. Edited by H. D. Saffrey. Paris: Vrin, 2002.
  - *In librum Beati Dionysii de Divinis Nominibus expositio*. Edited by Ceslai Pera. Rome: Marietti, 1950.
  - *Quaestiones disputatae de potentia*. In *Quaestiones Disputatae*, edited by P. Bazzi et al. Vol. 2. Turin: Marietti, 1949.
  - *Scriptum super libros sententiarum*. Vol. 1. Edited by Pierre Mandonnet. Paris: Lethielleux, 1929.
  - *Aquinas On Being and Essence: A Translation and Interpretation*. Translated by Joseph Bobik. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1965.
  - *Commentary on Aristotle's Physics*. Translated by Spath, and Thirkel Blackwell. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1963.
  - *On Spiritual Creatures [Q. de spir. creat.]*. Translated by Mary Fitzpatrick. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1949.
  - *On the Power of God: Quaestiones Disputatae de Potentia Dei*. Translated by English Dominican Fathers. London: Burns Oates and Washburn, 1932.
  - *On the Truth of the Catholic Faith: Summa Contra Gentiles*. Translated by James Anderson. Garden City, NY: Image Books, 1956.
  - *Summa Theologica*. Translated by Fathers of the English Dominican Province. New York: Benziger Bros., 1920.
  - *Treatise on Separate Substances: A Latin-English edition of a newly-established text based on 12 mediaeval manuscripts, with Introduction and notes*. Translated by Francis Lescoe. West Hartford, CN: St. Joseph College, 1963.
- William of Auvergne. *De Trinitate*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 2. Paris: Franciscum Muguet, 1674.



- . *De universo creaturarum*. Opera Omnia. Vol. 1. Paris: Dionysius Thierry, 1674.
- Wolff, Christian. *Psychologia Rationalis*. Verona: Dionysius Ramanzini, 1737.
- Zigliara, Tommaso Maria. *Cosmologia*. Summa Philosophica, 14th Ed. Vol. 2. Paris: Gabriel Beauchesne, 1905.

### Contemporary Works

- Adler, Mortimer. *The Angels and Us*. New York: MacMillan Publishing Co., 1982.
- Afnan, Soheil. *Avicenna: His life and works*. London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd, 1958.
- Anzulewicz, Henryk. "The Systematic Theology of Albert the Great." In *A Companion to Albert the Great*, edited by Irven Resnick. Leiden: Brill, 1993: 13-67.
- Bauerschmidt, Frederick. *Faith, Reason, and Following Christ*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Bazán, Bernardo Carlos. "On Angels and Human Beings: Did Thomas Aquinas succeed in demonstrating the existence of angels?" *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Âge* (Vrin) 77, no. 1 (2010): 47-85.
- . "The Human Soul: Form and Substance? Thomas Aquinas' Critique of Eclectic Aristotelianism." *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Age* 64 (1997): 95-126.
- Bertolacci, Amos. *The Reception of Aristotle's Metaphysics in Avicenna's Kitāb al-Šifā': A milestone of Western metaphysical thought*. Boston, MA: Brill, 2006.
- Blanchette, Oliva. *The Perfection of the Universe According to Aquinas: A Teleological Cosmology*. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1992.
- Bonino, Serge-Thomas. *Angels and Demons: A Catholic Introduction*. Translated by Michael Miller. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 2016.
- . "Aristotelianism and Angelology According to Aquinas." In *Aristotle in Aquinas's Theology*, edited by Gilles Emery and Matthew Levering. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015: 29-47.
- . "Le Thomisme de 1962 à 2012: Vue panoramique." Originally published in *Nova et vetera*, Fribourg Edition, 2012, Vol. 87, No. 4, p. 419-446. PDF file in Academia.edu, [https://www.academia.edu/37483512/Le\\_thomisme\\_de\\_1962\\_à\\_2012.pdf](https://www.academia.edu/37483512/Le_thomisme_de_1962_à_2012.pdf) (accessed April 15, 2024).
- . "L'âme Séparée." *Revue Thomiste*, no. 116 (2016): 71-103.
- Bonnette, David. *Aquinas' Proofs for God's Existence: St. Thomas Aquinas on: "The Per Accidens Necessarily Implies the Per Se"*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1972.
- Bougerol, Guy. *Introduction to the Words of Bonaventure*. Translated by José de Vinck. Paterson, NJ: St. Anthony Guild Press, 1964.
- Brisson, Luc, et al., ed. *Neoplatonic Demons and Angels*. Boston: Brill, 2018.
- Brock, Stephen. "Causality and Necessity in Thomas Aquinas." *Quaestio* 2 (1) (January 2002): 217-240.
- Burrell, David. "Avicenna." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 196-208.
- Cessario, Romanus. *A Short History of Thomism*. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 2005.
- Cole, Peter. "An Andalusian Alphabet." In *Selected Poems of Ibn Gabirol*, by Avicbron, translated by Peter Cole. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001: 3-37.
- Collins, James. *The Thomistic Philosophy of the Angels*. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 1947.
- Copleston, Frederick. *A History of Philosophy, Vol. 1: Greece and Rome*. New York: Doubleday, 1946.

- . *A History of Philosophy, Vol. 2: Medieval Philosophy: From Augustine to Duns Scotus*. New York: Doubleday, 1950.
- . *A History of Philosophy, Vol. 4: Modern Philosophy: From Descartes to Leibnitz*. New York: Doubleday, 1994.
- Cullen, Christopher. "Alexander of Hales." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 104-108.
- Davies, Brian. *Thomas Aquinas's Summa Theologiae: A Guide and Commentary*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Doolan, Gregory. "Aquinas on the Demonstrability of the Angels." In *A Companion to Angels in Medieval Philosophy*, edited by Tobias Hoffman. Boston, MA: Brill, 2012: 13-44.
- . *Aquinas on the Divine Ideas as Exemplar Causes*. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 2008.
- Dreyer, Mechtild. "Albertus Magnus." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 92-101.
- Eitenmiller, Melissa. "On the Separated Soul according to St. Thomas Aquinas." *Nova et Vetera, English Edition* 17, no. 1 (2019): 57-91.
- Friedländer, Michael. "Analysis of the Guide for the Perplexed." In *The Guide for the Perplexed*, by Moses Maimonides. Skokie, IL: Varda Books, 2002: xxxix-lix.
- Friedman, Russell. "Durand of St. Pourçain." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 249-253.
- Geoffroy, Marc et al. "Introduction." In *Commentaire sur le livre Lambda de la Métaphysique d'Aristote (Chapitres 6-10)*, by Avicenna. Paris: Vrin, 2014: 7-32.
- Gilson, Etienne. *The Christian Philosophy of St. Thomas*. Translated by Lawrence Shook. New York: Random House, 1966.
- . *The Philosophy of St. Bonaventure*. Translated by Illtyd Trethowan and Frank Sheed. Paterson, NJ: St. Anthony Guild Press, 1965.
- . *Thomism: The Philosophy of Thomas Aquinas*. Translated by Laurence Shook and Armand Maurer. Toronto, ON: PIMS, 2002.
- Grant, Edward, ed. "The Condemnation of Aristotle's books on natural philosophy in 1210 at Paris." In *A Source Book in Medieval Science*. Translated by Lynn Thorndike. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1974: 42-43.
- Henle, Robert. *Saint Thomas and Platonism: A Study of the Plato and Platonic Texts in the Writings of Saint Thomas*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1956.
- Hoffman, Tobias, ed. *A Companion to Angels in Medieval Philosophy*. Boston: Brill, 2012.
- Hugon, Edouard. *Metaphysica Ontologica. Cursus Philosophiae Thomisticae. Vol. 3*. Paris: Lethielleux, 1935.
- Ivry, Alfred. "Moses Maimonides." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 445-457.
- Jacob, Alfred. "Preface." In *The Fountain of Life (Fons Vitae)*, by Avicenna. Stanwood, WA: Sabian Publishing Society, 1987: v-vi.
- "James Collins (July 12, 1917 — February 19, 1985), American Educator, Philosopher." World Biographical Encyclopedia, <https://prabook.com/web/james.collins/589618> (accessed December 26, 2023).

- Janssens, Laurentius. *Tractatus De Deo Creatore et De Angelis*. Summa Theologica ad modum commentarii in Aquinatis Summam. Vol. 6. Fribourg: Herder, 1905.
- John Paul II. *Encyclical Letter Fides et Ratio*. Vatican City: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 1998.
- Jindráček, Efrem. “Les Preuves Philosophiques de l’Existence des Substances Séparées chez Thomas d’Aquin.” *A conference for the members of l’Académie des Science à Prague*. 20 April 2012.
- Keck, David. *Angels & Angelology in the Middle Ages*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- . “Bonaventure's Angelology.” In *A Companion to Bonaventure*, edited by Jay Hammond et al. Leiden: Brill, 2014: 289-332.
- Klima, Gyula. “John Buridan.” In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 340-348.
- Kok, Femke. “John Buridan’s Commentary on the Metaphysics.” In *A Companion to the Latin Medieval Commentaries on Aristotle’s Metaphysics*, edited by Fabrizio Amerini and Gabriele Galluzzo. Boston, MA: Brill, 2014: 495-549.
- Kondoleon, Theodore. “The Argument from Motion and the Argument for Angels: A Reply to John F.X. Knasas.” *The Thomist* 62 (1998): 269-290.
- Kuhn, Thomas. *The Copernican Revolution: Planetary Astronomy in the Development of Western Thought*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- Laird, Walter. “Change and Motion.” In *Cambridge History of Science, Vol. 2: Medieval Science*, edited by David Lindberg and Michael Shank. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013: 404-435.
- Lenz, Isabel Iribarren and Martin, ed. *Angels in Medieval Philosophical Inquiry: Their Function and Significance*. Hampshire: Ashgate, 2008.
- Lescoe, Francis. “Introduction.” In *Treatise on Separate Substances*, by Thomas Aquinas. West Hartford, CT: Saint Joseph College, 1963: 1-34.
- Lieberman, Kevin Michael. *Critique to Concord: Aquinas’s Reading of Plato and Aristotle on Separate Substances*. Rome: Pontifical University of the Holy Cross: School of Philosophy, 2023.
- Maritain, Jacques. *Degrees of Knowledge*. London: The Centenary Press, 1937.
- . “Réflexions sur la nécessité et la contingence.” *Angelicum* 14, no. 1/2 (1937): 281-295.
- McGinn, Bernard. *Thomas Aquinas’s Summa Theologiae: A biography*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2014.
- McInerney, Ralph. *St. Thomas Aquinas*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1982.
- . *Thomas Aquinas: Selected Writings*. London: Penguin Books, 1998.
- Monti, Dominic. “Introduction.” In *Breviloquium*. Works of St. Bonaventure, vol. 9, by Bonaventure. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 2005: xiii-l.
- Narcisse, Gilbert. *Les raisons de Dieu: Argument de convenance et esthétique théologique selon saint Thomas d’Aquin et Hans Urs von Balthasar*. Fribourg: Éditions universitaire de Fribourg, 1997.
- Owens, Joseph. *An Elementary Christian Metaphysics*. Milwaukee, WI: The Bruce Publishing Company, 1963.
- Pegis, Anton. *Introduction to St. Thomas Aquinas*. New York: Random House, 1948.
- Perrier, Joseph Louis. *The Revival of Scholastic Philosophy in the Nineteenth Century*. New York: The Columbia University Press, 1909.

- Reese, Philip-Neri. "Separate Substances and the Principles of Being as Being : Aquinas's (†1274) Aporia and Flandrensis's (†1479) Answer." *Documenti E Studi Sulla Tradizione Filosofica Medievale* 30 (2020): 383-416.
- "Remembering the Life of Bernardo BAZÁN." June 1, 2018. Ottawa Citizen Obituaries. <https://ottawacitizen.com/rememering.ca/obituary/bernardo-baz-n-1065880421> (accessed December 25, 2023).
- Resnick, Irven. "Albert the Great: Biographical Introduction." In *A Companion to Albert the Great*, edited by Irven Resnick. Leiden: Brill, 2013: 1-11.
- Rudavsky, Tamar. "Avencebrol." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 174-181.
- Rutkin, H. Darrell. "Astrology and Magic." In *A Companion to Albert the Great*, edited by Irven Resnick. Boston, MA: Brill, 2013: 451-505.
- Schiavone, Michael, ed. *Maltese Biographies of the Twentieth Century*. Pietà, Malta: Pubblikazzjonijiet Indipendenza, 1997.
- Snyder, Raymund. *The Principle of Metaphysical Continuity in Aquinas's Doctrine of Participation*. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America, 2017.
- Speer, Andreas. "Bonaventure." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 233-240.
- Spencer, Mark. "The Personhood of the Separated Soul." *Nova et Vetera, English Edition* 12, no. 3 (2014): 863-912.
- Stump, Eleonore. "Resurrection and the Separated Soul." In *The Oxford Handbook of Aquinas*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012: 458-466.
- Suarez-Nani, Tiziana. *Les Anges et la Philosophie*. Paris: Vrin, 2002.
- Taylor, Richard. "Averroes." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 182-195.
- Teske, Roland. *Studies in the Philosophy of William of Auvergne, Bishop of Paris (1228-1249)*. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 2006.
- . "William of Auvergne." In *A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, edited by Jorge Gracia and Timothy Noone. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006: 680-687.
- Thorndike, Lynn. *A History of Magic and Experimental Science*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1923-1958.
- Timotin, Andrei. *La démonologie platonicienne: histoire de la notion de daimôn de Platon aux derniers néoplatoniciens*. Philosophia Antiqua, 128. Boston: Brill, 2012.
- Toner, Patrick. "St. Thomas Aquinas on Death and the Separated Soul." *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly*, no. 91 (2010): 588-599.
- Torrell, Jean-Pierre. *Aquinas's Summa: Background, Structure, and Reception*. Translated by Benedict Guevin. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 2005.
- . *Saint Thomas Aquinas: Volume I, The Person and His Work*. Revised Edition. Translated by Robert Royal. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 2005.
- Twetten, David. "Albert the Great on Metaphysics." In *A Companion to Albert the Great*, edited by Irven Resnick. Leiden: Brill, 2013: 541-721.

- Urráburu, Joannes Josephus. *Psychologiae : pars secunda*. Institutiones Philosophicae. Vol. 6. Rome: Vallisoleti, 1898.
- Wade, Francis and Lottie Kendzierski. "Translators' Introduction." In *Commentary on Being and Essence*, by Thomas de Vio Cajetan, translated by Kendzierski and Wade. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1964: 1-37.
- Walz, Angelo. "Edouard Hugon." *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité*. Vol. 7, pt. 1. Paris: Beauchesne, 1969: 858-859.
- Weber, Hubert Philipp. "Alexander of Hales's Theology in His Authentic Texts (Commentary on the Sentences of Peter Lombard, Various Disputed Questions)." In *The English Province of the Franciscans (1224c.1350)*, edited by Michael Robson. Boston: Brill, 2017: 273-293.
- Weisheipl, James. "Albertus Magnus." In *Dictionary of the Middle Ages*, Vol. 1. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1982: 126-130.
- . *Friar Thomas D'Aquino: His life, thought and works*. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 1983.
- . "The Life and Works of St. Albert the Great." In *Albertus Magnus and the Sciences: Commemorative Essays 1980*, edited by James Weisheipl. Toronto: PIMS, 1980: 13-52.
- . "The Revival of Thomism as a Christian Philosophy." In *New Themes in Christian Philosophy*, edited by Ralph McInerny. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968: 164-185.
- White, Thomas Joseph. "Ressourcement Thomism." In *The New Cambridge Companion to Christian Doctrine*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 2022: 352-270.
- Wippel, John. *Metaphysical Themes in Thomas Aquinas*. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 1984.
- . *The Metaphysical Thought of Thomas Aquinas: From Finite Being to Uncreated Being*. Washington, DC: CUA Press, 2000.
- . "Thomas Aquinas and the Condemnation of 1277." *The Modern Schoolman* LXXII (January/March 1995): 233-272.
- Zammit, Paul. "De existentia substantiarum intellectualium." *Angelicum* 10 (1933): 513-523.
- Zammit, Paul. *Natale (4.2.1904-21.9.1995)*. [https://maltamigration.com/settlement/personalities/zammitpaul\\_natale.html](https://maltamigration.com/settlement/personalities/zammitpaul_natale.html) (accessed December 25, 2023).

## INDEX OF PROPER NAMES

- Adamidin, 120  
 Adler, Mortimer, 272  
 Albert the Great, 4, 47, 69, 81, 108-125, 237, 302  
 Alexander of Hales, 47, 69, 81-87, 94, 97, 188  
 Algazel, 110, 120  
 Anaxagoras, 14, 16, 186-187, 225, 227, 297  
 Anselm, 101, 107, 160, 189  
 Anzulewicz, Henryk, 109, 115  
 Aristotle, 3-4, 6-8, 10-15, 21-55, 61-62, 65, 69, 70-82, 87-92, 96, 98, 102-103, 105, 107, 111, 113, 118, 126-127, 135, 141-142, 144, 147, 149, 152, 159, 160-161, 163, 166, 168-170, 174, 187, 196, 198, 200-202, 214-215, 218, 222, 225, 227, 229, 230-238, 240, 247, 249, 259, 265, 267-268, 270-271, 273, 276, 279, 287, 294, 297, 301-308  
 Augustine, 12, 14, 21, 36, 115, 116, 119, 124, 156, 227, 234  
 Averroes, 25-27, 47-50, 69-74, 169  
 Avicenna, 16, 33, 37, 39, 47-48, 62-69, 147, 158, 163-166, 192, 212, 222, 306  
 Avicenna, 4, 22, 47-62, 64-65, 69, 71, 73-74, 77, 79, 87, 94-95, 110, 120, 169, 215, 306  
 Bauerschmidt, Frederick, 225, 312  
 Bazán, Bernardo Carlos, 2, 127, 150, 153, 185, 200-202, 215, 293-297  
 Bernard of Clairvaux, 112, 117, 119  
 Bertolacci, Amos, 52-53  
 Billuart, Charles-René, 238, 270, 274-275, 303  
 Blanchette, Oliva, 127, 132, 191, 197, 201, 299  
 Boethius, 116, 181, 209  
 Bonaventure, 1, 47, 62, 69, 81-82, 98-107, 119  
 Bonino, Serge-Thomas, 1, 3, 29, 142, 214, 225, 238, 292-293, 300-302, 304  
 Bougerol, Guy, 82  
 Boxadors, John Thomas, 276  
 Buridan, John, 2, 242, 246-252, 269-270, 272, 296  
 Burrell, David, 48, 56, 312  
 Cajetan, Thomas de Vio, 147, 178, 184-185, 252-257, 260, 264, 288, 300  
 Capreolus, Joannes, 251  
 Cessario, Romanus, 273  
 Cole, Peter, 63  
 Collins, James, 127, 141, 149, 166, 170-171, 186, 238, 280, 286-292, 300-301  
 Copernicus, Nicolas, 269-271, 303  
 Copleston, Frederick, 192, 235, 273  
 Cornoldi, Giovanni Maria, 280-283, 285, 303  
 Cullen, Christopher, 82  
 Davies, Brian, 179  
 Descartes, René, 20, 134, 273, 278-279  
 Diogenes, 14  
 Doolan, Gregory, 127, 170, 173, 175, 184-185, 187, 197-198, 215, 231, 238, 245, 296-298  
 Dreyer, Mechthild, 108  
 Duns Scotus, 1, 252  
 Durandus of St. Pourcain, 242-246, 252  
 Eitenmiller, Melissa, 214  
 Etienne Tempier, 5, 13, 33, 87, 241  
 Ferrariensis (Franciscus de Sylvestris), 171, 252, 257-261, 264, 270, 288, 300  
 Friedländer, Michael, 75-76  
 Galileo Galilei, 250, 271-272  
 Gilson, Etienne, 4, 9-10, 13, 100-101, 106, 184, 200, 299  
 Gregory the Great, 12  
 Gulielmus de Tocco, 99, 205  
 Henle, Robert, 15, 21-22, 35-36, 43, 194, 231  
 Heraclitus, 14  
 Hugh of St. Victor, 100  
 Hugon, Edouard, 280, 283-285  
 Ivry, Alfred, 75  
 Jacob, Alfred, 62  
 Janssens, Laurentius, 285  
 Jindráček, Efrem, 239, 304  
 John Damascene, 100

John of St. Thomas, 261, 262, 263  
 John of Vercelli, 233, 287, 302-303  
 Keck, David, 1, 82, 98, 99  
 Kendzierski, Lottie, 252  
 Kepler, Johannes, 272  
 Kilwardby, Robert, 241, 302  
 Klima, Gyula, 246  
 Kok, Femke, 247  
 Kondoleon, Theodore, 127, 167, 238  
 Kuhn, Thomas, 270-271  
 Laird, Walter, 248-249  
 Leo XIII, 252, 280, 286  
 Lescoe, Francis, 2, 5, 13-15, 33, 128, 226, 231  
 Maritain, Jacques, 20, 133, 237-238, 288  
 McGinn, Bernard, 251-252, 261, 273  
 McInerny, Ralph, 1, 8, 33, 276  
 Moses Maimonides, 4, 47, 48, 71, 75-79, 110  
 Narcisse, Gilbert, 225  
 Oresme, Nicole, 270-271  
 Owens, Joseph, 185  
 Pegis, Anton, 15-16, 21  
 Perrier, Joseph Louis, 281-282  
 Peter Lombard, 47, 81-82, 103, 121  
 Philip of the Most Holy Trinity, 275  
 Plato, 4, 6, 8, 10, 12-22, 27, 31-37, 39, 42-43, 45-47, 65, 74, 92, 116, 118, 126, 142, 162, 167-168, 187, 194, 198, 207, 214, 222, 225, 227, 230-232, 234, 237-238, 240, 273, 276, 297, 305  
 Poincot, John of St. Thomas, 261, 263-264  
 Porphyry, 124, 227, 234  
 Poseidonius, 192  
 Proclus, 15, 115  
 (Pseudo) Dionysius, 12, 109, 143, 146, 156, 171, 202, 224, 233, 290, 303, 306  
 Ptolemy, 111, 122, 270-271  
 Resnick, Irvn, 108, 113, 118-119  
 Roselli, Salvatore, 276-279, 303  
 Rudavsky, Tamar, 62  
 Sanseverino, Gaetano, 279, 283  
 Spencer, Mark, 214  
 Stump, Eleonore, 214  
 Suarez, Francisco, 262, 264-270  
 Suarez-Nani, Tiziana, 184, 300-302  
 Taylor, Richard, 69, 74  
 Teske, Roland, 87-89  
 Thales, 14  
 Toner, Patrick, 214, 315  
 Torrell, Jean-Pierre, 15, 33, 81, 108, 117-118, 120, 128, 186-187, 215, 226, 241-242, 250, 280, 282, 303  
 Twetten, David, 112-113  
 Urráburu, Joannes Josephus, 283, 285  
 Wade, Francis, 252  
 Walz, Angelo, 283  
 Weber, Hubert Philipp, 82  
 Weisheipl, James, 108-109, 113, 120, 241, 276, 279, 280  
 White, Thomas Joseph, 292  
 William Moerbeke, 5, 15, 115  
 William of Auvergne, 47, 81, 87-98, 148, 161, 169, 192, 237, 306  
 William of Melitona, 83  
 William of Ockham, 1, 246, 249  
 Wippel, John, 10-12, 48  
 Wolff, 2, 273, 296  
 Zammit, Paul, 127, 184, 288-299  
 Zigliara, Paul Natale, 280, 282-283, 285, 304